

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ט – העור והרוטב

דף קכד – Daf 124

1. *Machlokes* if two half-זיתים attached to a hide can combine for *tumah*

The next Mishnah states that if two half-זיתים of נבילה were attached to a hide, Rebbe Yishmael says: מטמא במשא ולא – *it is metamei through carrying*, since he carried a full כזית at once, *but* it is not *metamei through touching*, because the two pieces are touched separately. Rebbe Akiva says it is not even *metamei* with משא, as will be explained. Rebbe Akiva agrees וחסיתן בקיסם והסיטן – *regarding two half-זיתים of נבילה which one stuck onto a splinter and moved them*, that he is *tamei* (and he would rule the same for one who touches them). The reason he holds two small pieces attached to a hide are not *metamei* together is מפני שהעור מבטלן – *because the hide nullifies them*. Rebbe Ami quoted Rebbe Yochanan saying that Rebbe Yishmael only considers the meat significant if פלטתו חיה – *an animal's bite removed it* together with the hide, but if the skinner's knife intentionally removed it, it is nullified by the hide and not *metamei*. Others quoted Rebbe Yochanan saying that even a כזית of meat is nullified if it was intentionally removed during skinning.

2. *Machlokes* if נוגע וחוזר ונוגע, and if מאהיל וחוזר ומאהיל

Rebbe Yishmael taught that one who touches two half-זיתים attached to a hide remains *tahor*. Bar Padda says this is only if he touched the meat מאחוריו – *from behind* (through the hide). *But* if he touched the meat directly *from in front*, יש נוגע וחוזר ונוגע – *there is transmission of tumah through touching and again touching* (i.e., two simultaneous acts of touching the two half-זיתים). [Touching through the hide is not *metamei*, because he holds a שומר is ineffective for less than a כזית.] Rebbe Yochanan says that even if he touched the two pieces directly, Rebbe Yishmael would rule him *tahor*, because he holds אֵין נוגע וחוזר ונוגע. Rebbe Yochanan said that רבי דוסא בן הרכינס holds a similar opinion in a Mishnah which states: anything which is *metamei* אהל (i.e., parts of a dead body) which was divided into two pieces, each smaller than the minimum *shiur*, and were brought together into a house, רבי דוסא בן הרכינס says a person inside remains *tahor*, because he holds אין מאהיל וחוזר ומאהיל – *there is no tumah transmission through making an אהל and again making an אהל*, but the Chochomim say he is *tamei*.

3. Ulla: two half-זיתים of *neveilah* on a splinter are not *metamei* with משא

Ulla said that אפי' מוליך ומביא כל היום כולו – *if [one] stuck two half-זיתים on a splinter*, even if he carries them back and forth all day, he remains *tahor*. The *passuk* is written as "נִשָּׂא" – *that which is carried*, but is read as "נוֹשֵׂא" – *one who carries*, teaching: בעינן נושא והוא דנישא בבת אחת: – *we require that one carries* [נבילה], and it is carried as one, not in two pieces each smaller than a כזית. Rav Pappa explains that our Mishnah, which says two half-זיתים can be *metamei* with משא, is במרודד – *where a flattened strip of meat connects the two pieces*, enabling them to be carried together. The Gemara proves that Ulla's ruling is a *machlokes* Tannaim: the Tana Kamma says נבילה אחד הנוגע ואחד המסיט בלא נישא – *both one who touches and one who moves* [two half-זיתים of] meat which cannot be carried as one is *tamei*, but Rebbe Eliezer says: והוא דנישא – *this is only if it can be carried as one*.

Siman – Cookie Dough

The ice cream maker, working on the new **cookie dough** נבילה flavor, was thrilled that he didn't become *tamei* from touching a piece of skin with two half-kezaysim attached to it, since he didn't carry it but was dismayed when he heard that he did become *tamei* from flipping it over and touching the נבילה, because יש נוגע וחוזר ונוגע, and was annoyed at his assistant, who pointed out that, had he put it on a splinter, he could have carried it around all day with no worries.

דף קכד | DAF 124

Cookie Dough



The ice cream maker, working on the new **cookie dough** נבלה flavor, was thrilled that he didn't become *tamei* from touching a piece of skin with two *half-kezaysim* of נבלה attached to it, since he didn't carry it but was dismayed when he heard that he did become *tamei* from flipping it over and touching the נבלה, because נוגע וחוזר ונוגע, and was annoyed at his assistant, who pointed out that, had he put it on a splinter, he could have carried it around all day with no worries.

3 things to remember

1. **Machlokes** if two זיתים-half attached to a hide can combine for *tumah*
2. **Machlokes** if אין נוגע וחוזר ונוגע, and if מאהיל וחוזר ומאהיל
3. **Ulla**: two זיתים-half of *neveilah* on a splinter are not *metamei* with משא

